BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 06087047 4

# FAULT AND RESPONSIBILITY

Professor Bruce Chapman
Professor Mayo Moran

Spring 2003

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

# FAULT AND RESPONSIBILITY

**Professor Bruce Chapman**

**Professor Mayo Moran**

**Spring 2003**

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/faultresponsibil00chap_1

# FAULT AND RESPONSIBILITY

**CONTENTS**


**I Introduction**

"Moral Luck" – in Thomas Nagel, *Mortal Questions*
(Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1979) 24-38 ..... 1

"Moral luck" – in Bernard Williams, *Moral Luck: Philosophical Papers 1973 - 1980*
(Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1981) 20-39 ..... 9

Ripstein, A., "Equality, Luck, and Responsibility"
23 *Philosophy & Public Affairs* (1994) 3-23 ..... 19

**II Fault and Responsibility in Tort Law – General Theory**

Holmes, O., "The Common Law" (Boston: Little Brown, 1881) ..... 30

Honoré, T., "Responsibility and Luck,"
104 *The Law Quarterly Review* (1988) 530-553 ..... 33

Weinrib, E., "Liberty, Community, and Corrective Justice"
1(1) *Can. J. of Law & Jurisprudence* (1977) 3-17 ..... 45

**III Fault and Responsibility in Tort Law – Special Problems**

*Vaughan* v. *Menlove* (1837) 3 Bing. (N.C.) 468 ..... 53

Coleman, J., "Mental Abnormality, Personal Responsibility, and Tort Liability"
– in B.A. Brody & H.T. Engelhart Jr., (eds) *Mental Illness: Law and Public Policy*
(Holland: D. Reid Publishing Co., 1980) 107-133 ..... 56

*Laverdure et al* v. *City of Victoria* (1952) 7 W.W.R. 334 ..... 70

*McHale* v. *Watson* (1966) 115 C.L.R. 199 ..... 72

*Nelson* v. *Town of the Pas* (1969) 67 W.W.R. 580-583 ..... 81

*State* v. *Williams* (1971) 484 P. 2d, 1167-1174 ..... 83

## IV Fault and Responsibility in Criminal Law – General Theory

Horder, J., "Criminal Culpability: The Possibility of a General Theory"
12 *Law and Philosophy* (1993) 193-215 ..... 91

Duff, R.A., "Choice, Character, and Criminal Liability"
12 *Law and Philosophy* (1993) 345-383 ..... 103

Brudner, A., "Agency & Welfare in the Penal Law" – in S. Shite, J. Gardner, & J. Horder, (eds.) *Action and Value in Criminal Law*
(Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1993) 21-53 ..... 123

## V Fault and Responsibility in Criminal Law – Special Problems

### A. The *Mens Rea* Requirement

"Recklessness" – in R.A. Duff, *Intention, Agency & Criminal Liability: Philosophy of Action & the Criminal Law* (Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1990) 139-179 ..... 140

Pickard, T., "Culpable Mistakes and Rape: Relating Mens Rea to the Crime"
30 *U. of T. Law J.* (1980) 75-98 ..... 161

Headnote from *D.P.P. v. Morgan* [1976] A.C. 182 ..... 174

Headnote from *Pappajohn* v. *The Queen* [1980] 2 S.C.R. 120 ..... 175

Headnote from *Sansregret* v. *The Queen* [1985] 1 S.C.R. 570 ..... 177

Headnote from *R.* v. *Ewanchuk* (1998) 13 C.R. (5th) 324 (CA) ..... 178

Headnote from *R* v. *Ewanchuk* (1999) 1 S.C.R. 330 (SCC) ..... 181

### B. Defense of Provocation and Culture

Klimchuk, D., "Outrage, Self-Control, and Culpability"
44 *U. of T. Law J.* (1994) 441-468 ..... 185

Baker, B., "Provocation as a Defence for Abused Women Who Kill"
1(1) *Can. J. of Law & Jurisprudence* (1998) 193-211 ..... 200

Yeo, S., "Sex, Ethnicity, Power of Self-Control and Provocation Revisited"
18 *Sydney Law Review* (196) 304-322 ..... 210

Wong, C., "Good Intentions, Troublesome Applications: The Culture Defence and
Other Uses of Cultural Evidence in Canada" 42 *Criminal Law Q.* (1999) 367-396 ..... 220

**VI Individual Responsibility in 'Abnormal' Moral Contexts**

Delgado, R. "'Rotten Social Background': Should the Criminal Law Recognize a
Defence of Severe Environmental Deprivation?" 3 *Law & Inequality* (1985) 9 ..... 236

Vuoso, G., "Background, Responsibility, & Excuse"
96 *Yale Law J.* (1987) 1661-1686 ..... 247

Jaspers, K., "German Guilt" – in R.A. Falk, G. Kolko, & R.J. Lipton (eds.),
*Crimes of War* (New York: Random House, 1971) 476-485 ..... 261

*R.* v. *Finta* (1994) 112 D.L.R. (4th) 513 (excerpt) ..... 266

Calhoun, C., "Responsibility and Reproach" 99 *Ethics* (1989) 389-406 ..... 285

Wolf, S., "Sanity & the Metaphysics of Responsibility" 46-62..... 295

"The Politics of the Rule of Law" – in D. Dyzenhaus, *Judging the Judges,
Judging Ourselves: Truth, Reconciliation & the Apartheid Legal Order*
(Oxford: Hart Publishing, 1998) 136-183 ..... 304

**VII Individual Responsibility in Institutional Contexts**

Luban, D., "The Adversary System Excuse" – in D. Luban, ed., *The Ethics of Lawyers*
(New York: New York UP, 1994) 139-178 ..... 328

Wolf, S., "The Legal and Moral Responsibility of Organizations"
– in J. Pennock & J. Chapman (eds.,) *NOMOS XXVII: Criminal Justice*
(New York: New York UP, 1985) 267-286 ..... 349

**VII Remedying the Wrongs**

Sher, G., "Ancient Wrongs & Modern Rights"
10(1) *Philosophy & Pub. Affairs* (1980) 3-17 ..... 360

Bazyler, M.J., "Litigating the Holocaust" (1999) 33 *U. Rich. L. R.* 601 ..... 368

Wente, M., "Fifth Column – who pays for the sins of the fathers..."
*Globe & Mail,* Tues. Sept. 28, 1999 pg. A22 ..... 383

*F.S.M.* v. *Clarke* (1999) B.C.J. No 1973 ..... 384

Law Commission of Canada, *Restoring Dignity: Responding to Child Abuse in Canadian Institutions* (Ottawa: Minister of Public Works and Government Services, 2000) (Executive Summary) ..... 404

Chisolm, T.E., "Sweep Around Your Own Front Door: Examining the Argument for Legislative African American Reparations"
147(3) *U. of Penn. Law Rev.* (1999) 677-727 ..... 440

Allen, J., "Balancing Justice & Social Unity: Political Theory & the Idea of a Truth & Reconciliation Commission"
49(3) *U. of T. Law J.* (1999) 315-353 ..... 466